Police Officer Higher Education: An Omnibus Review of the Literature Identifying Factors Relevant to Police Officer Effectiveness

Lead Author: James E. Guffey, Ph.D. Co-Authors: Nancy Golden, J.D.; Richard Golden, J.D.; Ponzio Oliverio, J.D.

> National University, San Diego, California (All Authors)

> > A Paper Presented at

AABRI Conference, Savannah, Georgia

March 2024

### <u>Abstract</u>

Pundits in the realm of criminal justice administration tell us that a college degree is unnecessary for police officer applicants and beyond the practical reach of police agencies. Many studies have shown that a college degree has no application to policing and should not be a requirement for employment. Police chiefs and sheriffs have proclaimed that a college degree requirement shrinks the pool of potential candidates and thus makes recruiting even more difficult at a time when policing has been demeaned and vilified in the public's eye by the media. Contrary to the theme above, this article is among many that attempts to show that there are tangible benefits to hiring college graduates with an associate's degree but even more so for applicants with a bachelor's degree or higher.

## **Introduction**

The authors want to give you, the reader, a scenario. Let's consider the reality in the vast majority of today's police agencies. The education level is a high school diploma or GED, and the minimum age is 21 years. Now let's look at this profile: A 21-year-old male or female with a gun, a high school diploma, and academy training that may, at best, be 6 months but most likely will be less. A significant portion of the training will be on the proper and legal use of firearms where the trainee will draw and shoot at a target which may be simulated or live on a range. Now, let's consider that as recently as 2020 just 37% of 12th-graders reached or exceeded the academic preparedness benchmarks for both math and reading that would qualify them for entry-level college courses – a figure unchanged since 2015 (Carmera, 2020, para 2). If this is the national standard for police officers, there is no wonder that policing is so out-of-touch with its own constituents and the U.S. society in general. Ostensibly, this profile cannot be sustained in our high-tech, advanced society in the year 2024 and going forward.

## **Study Limitations**

There have been hundreds of articles written about police higher education since the report by the President's Commission on Law Enforcement and the Administration of Justice in 1967 titled, "The Challenge of Crime in a Free Society" in which the Commission recommended the requirement of a baccalaureate degree for entry-level police officers by 1982. So, it was impossible for the authors to include even a small percentage of these articles for this study. Therefore, we carefully chose articles in six applicable categories that the authors believe represent the movement toward professionalization, and the reduction of the most ubiquitous criticisms of untoward police conduct since the Challenge of Crime in a Free Society Report. These six categories (dependent variables) are (1) citizen complaints, (2) communication skillsreport writing efficiency, (3) ethical behavior, (4) police officer production efficiency, (5) supervisor evaluations, and (6) use of force. These six dependent variables are matched with the single independent variable of higher education. In our articles selected, the authors identify higher education as possession of an AA degree or higher. It should be noted that these six dependent variables are the ones most often appearing in the selected articles. The authors also sought to find a mix of articles that found higher education was both a positive as well as a negative or neutral factor on all six variables so as to not show obvious biased toward higher education. However, the vast majority of the articles do conclude that higher education is positively correlated with all six dependent variables.

Another possible limitation to our study is most of the pertinent and better designed studies fall into the period 1970-2000 because this was the period in which policing and criminal justice reform was a focus of the federal government (noteworthy are The President's Commission on Law Enforcement and the Administration of Justice—1967 and Clinton's

Violent Crime Control and Safe Streets Act of 1994). By 2000, the federal government's push to reform policing and its failed goal to implement the promised goal of 1982 as the year during which all new police hires would be college graduates, had all but been abandoned. The elimination of the Law Enforcement Education Program (LEEP) in 1984 ended the millions of dollars in grants to colleges and universities for police officers' higher education and also signaled the end of the federal government's emphasis on police officer higher education.

## Literature Review

There has been a plethora of studies that argue both sides of this issue—degree or no degree for police officers. The studies that purport to show no ostensible benefit of a degree generally argue two points: (1) college-educated police officers do not produce the "enforcement numbers" of their fellow non-degreed officers, and (2) they are not as "dedicated" to the job as non-degreed officers as shown by their greater turnover. The retort to (2) is that business, and all other occupations also experience turnover.

An interesting discussion on Lexipol's Police 1 (2022) asked the question, "State your case: Should prospective cops be required to have college degrees?" The responses from the police officers and executives were about even. The disturbing theme, however, from the respondents who rejected the idea of having college educated police officers was that college educated cops have no "common sense," so it is much better to have experienced military persons who have "been there and done this" and who have made decisions in life and death situations. Of course, the response to this is that the vast majority of military personnel, like police officers, have never had to make a decision whether to take a person's life or not.

## **Officer Attitudes Toward a College Education**

The data show that officers throughout the U.S. see education as important even though it adds to their time commitments with regard to balancing job, family, and leisure. Hilal and Densley (2013) surveyed officers in Minnesota and Arizona to determine the extent of police officer dedication to obtain a college degree. They surveyed a total of 964 officers in both states.

When asked about educational levels, 849 or 88 percent reported having at least a 2-year degree (Minnesota requires a 2-year degree for hire). Forty-eight percent of the officers stated that they had a 4-year degree or greater. This is 20 percent higher than the 27.9 percent of the U.S. population who reported in the 2010 census that they had a bachelor's degree or higher (para 4).

This article shows on a micro-level that police officers do value a college degree, and once they acquire one, the more likely they are to continue their educations to the next degree level. The data clearly indicates that most officers value one or more college degrees. In most cases this is the case because a promotion is dependent on acquiring the degree, or the rank of police officer is incentivized by a percentage increase of between 1-5 percent. A growing number of departments also offer tuition reimbursement plans that return all or a portion of the tuition costs based on the grade received.

# What is the Nation-wide Requirement for Education for the Almost 18,000 Police Agencies?

Only 8 percent of the police and sheriff's agencies in the U.S. require some education above a high school diploma as a requirement for application (Hudgins, 2014). Most of these agencies require an AA degree; however, many have an alternative to the degree such 2-3 years of active military duty with an honorable discharge or 2-3 years of police experience with another agency. Almost non-existent is a requirement for a bachelor's degree. In this study, the

authors found only two U.S. police departments and two U.S. sheriff's departments that require a bachelor's degree, and these are the Arlington, Texas and the Tulsa, Oklahoma PDs and the Multnomah County, Oregon and the Clarke County, Washington Sheriff's Offices. Most of the federal police agencies require a four-year degree. These include the Federal Bureau of Investigation (FBI), Alcohol, Tobacco, Firearms, and Explosives (ATF), Central Intelligence Agency (CIA), US Customs and Border Patrol, U.S. Secret Service, and the U.S. Marshals. It can be argued that the job duties and expectations of a city police officer or county sheriff are more complex and require better interpersonal skills than what should be expected of the federal law enforcement agencies identified above.

## Historical Timeline of the Requirement of a Bachelor's Degree

The impetus for requiring a bachelor's degree for U.S. law enforcement officers began with the publication of the 1967 report, *The Challenge of Crime in a Free Society*. This publication emanated from President Lyndon Johnson's Commission on Law Enforcement and the Administration of Justice. This commission was formed after the turbulent 1960s that saw rioting in many of the largest cities and the forceful response by police agencies and the callingup of the National Guard in many states and in particular Michigan by then governor George W. Romney. The stated goal was to have a national requirement that all local and state law enforcement officers have a bachelor's degree as a requirement for employment by 1982.

Johnson's administration got legislation passed to provide funding for this goal. It established the Law Enforcement Assistance Administration (LEAA) as a part of the Omnibus Crime Control and Safe Streets Act of 1968. LEAA was tasked with providing "block grants" to all 50 states that would be used to reduce crime. The LEAA block grant program was launched in 1968. Another funded program in LEAA was the Law Enforcement Education Program

(LEEP) which sought to begin the process of achieving the bachelor's degree requirement by awarding grants to universities with criminal justice and criminology programs. The universities were given the authority to award grants to students up to a limited amount, and the student accepting the grant was required to "repay" the grant by being hired by a law enforcement agency and working as a law enforcement officer for four years. The lead author, Dr. Guffey, received his master's degree from Sam Houston State University with a LEEP grant that would not have been possible without the grant and repaid the grant with a career in law enforcement.

This program was successful in increasing the number of law enforcement officers with bachelor's degrees, but it was clear by 1982 that it was not going to achieve the *Challenge of Crime in a Free Society's* goal of the 50 states requiring a bachelor's degree. LEAA and its subsidiary, LEEP, were disbanded in 1982.

## The Decrease in Requirements for Police Officer Selection

Some police agencies regress their entry-level requirements from time-to-time and a higher education requirement is generally the first to be jettisoned. In an attempt to increase the pool of applicants for police officer positions, some police agencies have resorted to reducing their existing entry qualifications or making some criminal offenses and questionable behaviors acceptable for consideration for hire which heretofore would have been automatic rejection of an applicant. The most recent example of a police agency reducing its educational requirement occurred in Pennsylvania. Governor Josh Shapiro announced on August 23, 2023 that the requirement for college credits to be eligible for consideration for hire as a Pennsylvania State Police Officer would be dropped to possessing a high school diploma or GED. This requirement

had stood for 30 years. The reason given by Shapiro was, "to open up police careers to a wider pool of applicants" (Hoopes, 2023, para 1). Reducing the requirements for police officer entry to increase the pool of applicants has generally been fraught with an increase in police officer malfeasance. "I cannot recall any instance in which the lowering police hiring standards led to a positive result — this idea always ends badly" (Wyllie, 2016, para 8). The authors have tried to make this as visible as possible with the tables below that are taken from the Law Enforcement Management and Administrative System (LEMAS).

# Percentage of state and local law enforcement agencies which <u>considered</u> applicants with selected negative prior events, by size and type of agency--2008.

This is "old" data from 2008. The authors cannot confirm whether these tables and their data are applicable to agencies recently. It appears that LEMAS statisticians stopped gathering this data after the 2008 census. Nevertheless, one can assume that some of these hiring practices may still be applicable today because law enforcement agencies are seeing unprecedented resignations and retirements as a result of the Defund the Police Movement. It is during these periods of police renunciation that make policing less attractive as an occupation and departments look to "reduce their standards" and accept less qualified applicants.

 Table 1—Considered Credit Related Problems in Percentages

	All Agencies	Local	Sheriff	Primary State
All Sizes	66	66	66	87
500+ officers	94	91	100	94
100-499	86	86	87	71
25-99	72	73	68	_

10-24	66	68	60	
<10	61	61	61	_

Source: Bureau of Justice Statistics Law Enforcement Management and Administrative System Survey, 2008. https://bjs.ojp.gov/content/pub/pdf/hrslleo08st.pdf.

This table shows the percentage of reporting law enforcement agencies by size that **<u>considered</u>** applicants with credit related problems. A dash indicates this data was not available.

 Table 2—Considered Misdemeanor Convictions in Percentages

	All Agencies	Local	Sheriff	Primary State
All Sizes	60	59	66	85
500+	86	84	94	85
100-499	81	80	82	86
25-99	66	65	68	
10-24	59	58	63	_
<10	56	55	60	

Source: Bureau of Justice Statistics Law Enforcement Management and Administrative System Survey, 2008. https://bjs.ojp.gov/content/pub/pdf/hrslleo08st.pdf.

This table shows the percentage of reporting law enforcement agencies by size that <u>considered</u> applicants with certain non-violent misdemeanor convictions. A dash indicates this data was not available.

 Table 3—Considered Job Related Problems in Percentages

	All Agencies	Local	Sheriff	Primary State
All Sizes	50	49	51	79
500+	85	83	94	82
100-499	72	73	70	71
25-99	71	76	59	_
10-24	50	54	39	—
<10	30	31	25	

Source: Bureau of Justice Statistics Law Enforcement Management and Administrative System Survey, 2008. https://bjs.ojp.gov/content/pub/pdf/hrslleo08st.pdf.

This table shows the percentage of reporting law enforcement agencies by size that **<u>considered</u>** applicants with certain job-related problems. The LEMAS data did not specify what a job-related problem is; however, it can be surmised that it is a firing or poor performance at a previous job which can include a firing from a previous law enforcement agency. A dash indicates this data was not available.

	All Agencies	Local	Sheriff	Primary State
All Sizes	47	48	46	91
500+	87	86	88	91
100-499	84	87	80	93
25-29	71	76	59	_
10-24	50	54	39	_
<10	30	31	25	—

Table 4—Considered Marijuana Use in Percentage

Source: Bureau of Justice Statistics Law Enforcement Management and Administrative System Survey, 2008. https://bjs.ojp.gov/content/pub/pdf/hrslleo08st.pdf.

This table shows the percentage of reporting law enforcement agencies by size that **<u>considered</u>** applicants who have used marijuana. Most agencies set a period in the past as a cut-off for use which is around 3-6 months. Marijuana use is still a federal Schedule-1 drug, so, by considering an applicant, the department is considering an applicant with an admitted federal felony drug crime. A dash indicates this data was not available.

	All Agencies	Local	Sheriff	Primary State
All Sizes	47	48	46	91
500+	87	86	88	91
100-499	77	78	76	79
25-99	59	61	52	
10-24	35	33	39	
<10	33	33	28	

Table 5—Considered a Suspended Driver's License in Percentage

Source: Bureau of Justice Statistics Law Enforcement Management and Administrative System Survey, 2008. https://bjs.ojp.gov/content/pub/pdf/hrslleo08st.pdf. This table shows the percentage of reporting law enforcement agencies by size that **<u>considered</u>** applicants who have had a license suspension for any reason. A dash indicates this data was not available.

	All Agencies	Local	Sheriff	Primary State
All Sizes	34	32	42	81
500+	78	70	89	85
100-499	65	63	68	71
25-99	48	50	45	—
10-24	35	33	39	_
<10	24	23	32	—

 Table 6—Considered a DUI Conviction in Percentage

Source: Bureau of Justice Statistics Law Enforcement Management and Administrative System Survey, 2008. https://bjs.ojp.gov/content/pub/pdf/hrslleo08st.pdf.

This table shows the percentage of reporting law enforcement agencies by size that <u>considered</u> applicants who have a DUI conviction. A dash indicates this data was not available.

	All Agencies	Local	Sheriff	Primary State
All Sizes	7	7	7	21
500+	27	31	23	21
100-499	19	20	19	21
25-99	10	11	8	—
10-24	6	7	5	
<10	4	4	4	

 Table 7—Considered Gang Affiliation in Percentage

Source: Bureau of Justice Statistics Law Enforcement Management and Administrative System Survey, 2008. https://bjs.ojp.gov/content/pub/pdf/hrslleo08st.pdf.

This table shows the percentage of reporting law enforcement agencies by size that **<u>considered</u>** applicants who have a confirmed previous gang affiliation. A dash indicates this data was not available.

It should be nothing less than "shocking" that agencies were even <u>considering</u> applicants with these handicaps in 2008 and possibly even after 2008. When considering police professionalism and reform, the most important factor should be recruiting and hiring the best and most qualified applicants, but this is not accomplished when these recruiting exceptions are employed. Moreover, professionalization and reform are not achieved when an educational requirement of a high school diploma is the baseline for hiring police officers.

The McFarland, California Police Department disgraced itself by hiring police officers that had many of the above unconscionable behaviors. A *San Jose Mercury News* story found that, "One of every five officers who worked at the McFarland Police Department in the past decade had been previously fired, sued for misconduct or convicted of a crime" (Rusch and Du Sault, 2019, para 1). The McFarland, California Police Department's reckless and unprofessional hiring was uncovered, but it makes one wonder how many other agencies are employing the same reckless hiring but have not been exposed.

## <u>Omnibus Review of Police Officer Higher Education's Correlation to Six Dependent</u> <u>Variables</u>

The following Tables 8-13 display a synopsis of the articles selected for the six variables described earlier (use of force, supervisor evaluations, communication skills/report writing efficiency, ethical behavior/abuse of authority, production efficiency, and citizen/administrative complaints) and a brief description of the study population and method used. The last two columns indicate whether the study showed a positive correlation with the variable or no correlation or an unconfirmed correlation. An "x" in both columns indicates that a portion of the study showed a positive correlation. Some of the studies can be considered to be "weak" in that they employed a small sample size, whereas

others were clearly "strong" in that they had large, diverse sample sizes. The authors chose not

to indicate which were weak and which were strong because this would be opinion at best.

Readers who are interested in learning more about each article should find the affiliated

reference in the Reference Section.

Study	Synopsis	Study Subjects/Population	Positive Correlation between Higher Ed and Less Use of Force	No or Unconfirmed Correlation between Higher Ed and Use of Force
Rydberg & Terrill (2010)	College education does significantly reduce the likelihood of force occurring. Results may be due to the amount of discretion officer's exercise in pursuing these behaviors	Observational data from two medium-sized cities	x	
Terrill & Mastrofski (2002)	In encounters involving officers with a high school education, there was a 44% and 20% chance of verbal and physical force being applied, compared to 42% and 15%, respectively, for those involving officers with a bachelor's degree	Data collected as part of an observational study of the police in Indianapolis, Indiana, and St. Petersburg, Florida	X	
Morabito & Doerner (1997)	Male, college- educated, and veteran police officers were more likely to choose OC spray over other permissible hand-to- hand techniques.	Tallahassee Florida PD- -A total of 633 police officer- civilian OC spray encounters took place. Male, college- educated, and veteran police officers were more likely to choose OC spray over other permissible hand-to- hand techniques		X
Paoline & Terrill (2007)	The findings indicate that varying levels of education and experience are related to differences in the use of coercion in encounters with citizens. Encounters	This study uses two data sets (i.e., systematic social observation [SSO] of patrol officers and in- person interviews of those officers from the Project on Policing	X	

Table 8—Police Office	r Higher Education's	<b>Correlation with</b>	Use of Force
Table 0 Tonee Office	Ingher Duucation s	Correlation with	Use of Force

	involving officers with any college education result in significantly less verbal force compared to those with a high school education. However, only those encounters involving officers with a 4-year degree result in significantly less physical force.	Neighborhoods(POPN), which examined policing in Indianapolis, Indiana, and St. Petersburg, Florida, during the summers of 1996 and 1997, respectively		
Sherman and Blumberg (1981)	Until more and older college graduates are available for study it is probably not possible to conclude what impact college, and different kinds of college education, have upon police use of deadly force.	This study compares the educational levels of officers who did and did not shoot their weapons, who shot following different types of citizen behavior, and who shot with and without justification over a seven-year period in the Kansas City, Missouri police department		x
McElvain & Kposowa, (2008)	College-educated officers were less likely to be involved in shootings than officers with no college education	Data were collected from the Riverside County Sheriff's Department (RCSD), the 44th-largest law enforcement department in the United States based on the Law Enforcement Management and Administrative Statistics	x	
Telep, (2011)	The study finds that officers with a pre- service bachelor's degree hold attitudes that are less supportive of abuse of authority, although the effect is fairly small in magnitude. These effects remain regardless of when officers receive their degree and across varying levels of higher education (i.e., associate's degree, attending some college).	Random sample of 1,112 policed officers from 121 US police agencies.	X	
Aamodt, (2004)	Better-educated officers use force less often	Aamodt (2004) conducted a meta- analysis of several studies considering the effects of officer education on a variety	X	

		of police-related		
		circumstances,		
N (2010)	T 1 CC	including use of force.		
Vespucci, (2019)	Level of force was	This study collected		Х
	measured at multiple	self-reported survey		
	levels: verbalization,	data from 425 sworn		
	soft techniques, hard	law enforcement		
	techniques, blunt	officers throughout six		
	impact, chemical,	states.		
	controlled energy			
	device, and lethal			
	force. Officers with			
	graduate degrees used			
	force a slightly more			
	than non-degreed officers; officers with			
	-			
	undergraduate degrees used force slightly			
	more than non-			
	degreed officers, but			
	the difference was			
	barely significant.			
Shjarback & White,	The robustness of	Data were gathered	х	
(2015)	the college	from a sampling	~	
(2013)	education finding	frame of local law		
	across both	enforcement		
	indicators of			
		agencies with over		
	police-citizen	100 sworn full-time		
	violence, from	officers, resulting in		
	different sources of	a sample of 526		
	data, provides	departments. These		
	strong support for	departments		
	the requirement that	constitute 56% of all		
	police officers	sworn full-time		
	should have at least	municipal officers in		
	some college	the country, serving		
	education (e.g., an	about 32% of the		
	associate's degree)	population		
	prior to	reraintion		
	employment.			
	empioyment.			

Of the ten selected articles, seven resulted in the finding that college educated officers generally used less force than their non-college educated counter-part officers. Three studies indicated no significant difference or that officers used slightly less force.

## Table 9—Police Officer Higher Education and Supervisor Evaluations

Study	Synopsis	Study Subjects/Population	Positive Correlation between Higher Ed and Less Use of Force	No or Unconfirmed Correlation between Higher Ed and Use of Force
Rogers (2003)	Officers with a college degree, either AA or	61 police officer personnel files from a North Dakota PD	X	

	BA/BS, received			
	overall superior			
	supervisor			
	evaluations			
Dailey (2002)	A significant	The officers (N=489)	Х	
	relationship was	were employed in a		
	found between the	city with a		
	composite set of	population of		
	independent	260,000 and a		
	variables of age,	jurisdictional area of		
	educational level,	280 square miles.		
	prior military			
	experience and prior			
	law enforcement			
	experience and the			
	dependent variable			
	of police			
	commendations.			
Engel, R.S &	The results also	24 PDs in 3		Х
Worden, R.E.	show that officers'	metropolitan areas		
(2006)	performance in	(Rochester, NY; St.		
	police-citizen	Louis, MO; and		
	encounters,	Tampa-St.		
	measured in terms	Petersburg, FL.		
	of citizens'			
	evaluations, is			
	largely unrelated to			
	officers' educational			
$\Gamma$	backgrounds.	97 officers and 113		
Finnigan (1976)	A comparison of		Х	
	evaluation reports	agents in the Baltimore Police		
	on non-college			
	educated police	Department		
	officers and college educated agents			
	indicated that the			
	latter consistently			
	received higher			
	evaluations,			
	regardless of type of			
	degree			
Cascio (1977)	None of the	Data are reported for		X
	behaviorally	825 White, 60 Black,		Λ
	anchored	and 55 Spanish-		
	performance ratings	surnamed officers		
	were related to			
	formal education.			
Smith and Aamodt	Significant	299 police officers	Х	
(1997)	correlations were	from 12 municipal		
	found between	police departments		
	education and most	across the state of		
	measures of			
		between education		
	results show a	and police		
	significant	performance		
	measures of performance. Most importantly, the results show a	Virginia to determine the relationship between education and police		

	correlation between			
	overall performance			
	and education			
	(r=24, p.<001)			
Hayeslip (1989)	Meta-analysis of 10	It has been shown in	Х	
	studies on police	this study that by		
	higher education	cumulating across		
	and performance	studies we can find		
	···· <b>I</b> ····	consistent agreement		
		that education and		
		police performance		
		are moderately		
		related.		
Roberg (1978)	As a group, the men	118 non-supervisory	X	
Kobelg (1978)	with at least one	patrol officers of the	λ	
		Lincoln, Nebraska		
	year of college	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·		
	education were	P.D.		
	more likely to be			
	promoted and			
	significantly less			
	likely to receive			
	civilian complaints			
	than less educated			
	officers			
Truxillo et al.	College education	Study investigated	Х	
(1998)	variables showed a	the relationship		
	statistically	between measures of		
	significant	college education		
	relationship with	and work		
	promotions (average	performance for a		
	r = .31), and	cohort of 84 police		
	supervisory ratings	officers over a 10-		
	of job knowledge	year period		
	(average $r = .25$ )			

Of the nine selected studies, seven indicated superior evaluations of college educated officers versus non-college educated officers.

Study	Synopsis	Study Subjects/Population	Positive Correlation between Higher Ed and Police Officer Production	No or Unconfirmed Correlation between Higher Ed and Police Officer Production
Cascio (1977)	Formal education associated with fewer injuries, fewer assaults, fewer disciplinary actions from accidents, fewer sick times per year, and fewer physical force allegations	Statistical analysis of 940 active-duty Miami-Dade police officers	X	

				· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
Finnigan (1975)	The Baltimore Police Agents were consistently rated higher than the non- degreed officers on four performance criteria: duty performance, character traits, overall value, and performance under pressure.	113 police agents (4- year degree) compared to 97 non- degreed police officers	X	
Sanderson (1977)	Educational levels were compared to the following performance variables: (1) police academy performance, (2) disciplinary history, (3) absenteeism, (4) terminations, and (5) career advancement. In each of the five performance variables tested in the study, college education showed a positive effect.	10-year longitudinal study of 117 LAPD officers.	x	
Hooper (1988)	The current study's findings show no appreciable differences across educational levels in the performance of police duties. However, a 4-year degree in criminal justice administration did show a significant difference.	The study was comprised of 129 LAPD officers		X

Of the four studies examined, three indicated a positive correlation between higher education and police performance. Only one study showed no appreciable difference. It is important to define what these studies showed as positive performance measures. In the selected studies, performance was **not** measured by arrests, tickets issued, street light outages reported, etc. The measures used were commendations, probationary and semi-annual performance evaluations, police academy standing, and career sick leave taken, and error rate on police reports.

Table 11—Higher Education and Ethical Behavior/Abuse of Authori	ity
---	-----

Study	Synopsis	Study	Positive	No or
-		Subjects/Population	Correlation	Unconfirmed
			between Higher	Correlation
			Ed and Ethical	between Higher
			Behavior	

				Ed and Ethical Behavior
Tyre and Braunstein (1992) Study 1: Forced Choice Scenarios	Experimental Group: Police officers with at least 2-year degree. Control Group: Non-Sworn Citizens. Police officer responses to ethical dilemmas were correct 12 times greater than control	50 active police officers from 2 Florida PDs and 60 non-sworn citizens	X	
Tyre and Braunstein (1992) Study 2: <i>Examination of</i> <i>Decertifications</i>	Examination of police officer decertifications by the Florida Criminal Justice Standards and Training Commission (FCJSTC) years 1987 and 1988 1987—Officers who did not possess a 2-year degree were roughly 4 times more likely to be decertified. 1988—35% of Florida officers had at least 2-year degree, but only 15% were brought before the FDLE	All Florida officers brought before the FCJSTC in 1987 and 1988.	X	
Shernock, 1992	Educational level was found to be related to placing greater emphasis on ethical conduct	177 patrol officers in 11 police departments in the New England states and New York state.	x	
Delattre, 2002	Officers with less than two years of college were four times likely than officers with two or more years of college to face discipline by commissions for moral character or violations	Undefined	X	
Carter and Sapp, 1990	"Although not conclusive, the research suggests that higher education provided	455 municipal police departments included in the study; 347 (76.3%)	Х	

			1	
	a number of benefits for law enforcement:" Carter and Sapp identified 18 bulleted points, most of which can be construed to show a positive correlation between higher education and ethical behavior. (pp. 62- 63)	responded. Total of 502 responses.		
Telep, 2010	The study found that officers with a pre-service bachelor's degree hold attitudes that are less supportive of abuse of authority, although the effect is fairly small in magnitude.	A total of 113 departments (93.4%) agreed to participate in the study. The participating agency sample consisted of eight certainty departments (89%), 78 midsize departments (93%), and 27 small departments (96.5%). Random sampling generated a sample of 1,112 potential respondents.	X	
White & Kane, 2013	Found that "officers with Associate or Bachelor's degrees were less likely to be separated for misconduct (i.e., criminal and drug failures) as compared with less educated officers"	This research is a comparison of the personal and career histories of all 1,543 officers who were involuntarily separated from the New York City Police Department (NYPD) for cause during 1975–1996 with a randomly selected sample of their police academy classmates who served honorably.	X	

All seven studies showed that higher educated officers were more ethical and understood the importance of not abusing their authority.

## Table 12—Communication Skills/Report Writing Efficiency

Study	Synopsis	Study Subjects/Population	Positive Correlation between Higher Ed and Communication/Report Writing Efficiency	No or Unconfirmed Correlation between Higher Ed and Communication/Report Writing Efficiency
Edwards, B.D. 2019	College educated officers are better communicators	A total of 533 sworn officers were employed by the five police departments. Of these, 216 respondents completed the survey, for a response rate of 40.53%. Officers who completed the survey were, on average, 40 years old and had been employed as a police officer for an average of 14 years.	X	
Smith and Aamodt, 1997	College educated officers are better communicators	This study used data from 299 police officers from 12 municipal police departments across the state of Virginia to determine the relationship between education and police performance.	X	
Bruns and Magnan, 2014	College educated officers are better communicators	qualitative data from 61 police officers of all ranks and educational backgrounds from the Midwest examine attitudes pertaining to the necessity of a college-educated force.	X	
Breci, 1997	College educated officers are better communicators	A random sample of Minnesota police officers	Х	
Carlan and Byzbe, 2000	College educated officers are better communicators	Students from three southern colleges read vignettes and sentenced a murder defendant and an automobile theft defendant to a term of imprisonment.	X	

Carter and	College educated	All state	х	
Sapp, 1990	officers are	police agencies, all		
······································	better	municipal agencies		
	communicators	serving populations		
		greater than 50,000,		
		and all		
		sheriff's departments		
		with more than 100		
		sworn officers were		
		surveyed to obtain		
		data on the level		
		of higher education		
		in the departments,		
		policies in support of		
		college education,		
		and the effect of		
		higher education on		
		policing.		
Worden,	College educated	Police Executive	Х	
1990	officer	Research Forum		
	respondents	(PERF) study cited		
	tended to believe	above		
	they			
	communicate			
	better with the			
	citizenry			

All six selected studies showed that higher educated officers were better communicators and wrote superior reports that led to more cases charged.

## Table 13—Citizen/Administrative Complaints

Study	Synopsis	Study Subjects/Population	Positive Correlation between Higher Ed and Fewer Complaints	Negative or Unconfirmed Correlation between Higher Education and Complaints
Kappeler, Sapp, & Carter (1992)	found "that college educated officers had significantly few founded citizen- initiated complaints" (p. 44)	The study population included 120 full-time officers during a 5-year period by a medium- sized municipal agency in the Midwest	X	
Cohen & Chaiken (1972)	reported that officers who were more educated received fewer complaints.	This was a 12-year longitudinal study of 1,608 NYPD officers	Х	
Cascio (1977)	found that officers with higher levels	an examination of 940 police officers in the	Х	

			ı	I
	of education were	Dade County, Florida		
	the subjects of	Police Department		
	fewer allegations	_		
	of excessive force			
Terrill &	found that for	more than 5,500 citizen	Х	
	officers with a 2-	complaint allegations are	А	
Ingram (2015)	or 4-year degree	examined across eight		
	there was a	cities		
	correlation	enties		
	between degree			
	and fewer			
	sustained citizen			
	complaints			
Carter, Sapp, &	Officers that	data collected from 699	Х	
Stephens	possessed a 2- or	state and local police		
(1988)	4-year degree had	agencies across the		
(1900)	few sustained	United States		
	citizen complaints			
Lersch &	officers with 2 or	analysis of 233 Sheriff	Х	
Kunzman	more years of	Deputies from a large	~	
	college education	Southeastern agency		
(2001)	generated fewer	over a five plus year		
	complaints than	period.		
	those with less	periou.		
	education.			
Monio	found that officers	examined 3 years of		
Manis,	without a 4-year	citizen complaint data	Х	
Archibold, &	-	from an unidentified		
Hassell (2008)	degree generated a			
	higher number of	Midwestern municipal		
	formal complaints,	agency involving 105		
	but when	officers looking at the		
	education was	role of education (in		
	considered	terms of level and major)		
	collectively with	in relation to complaint		
	experience levels,	frequency, complaint		
	the effect	type, disposition, and		
	dissipated.	sanction		
Boss (2019)	agencies requiring	Existing LEMAS data on	Х	
	the levels of	police higher education		
	education	and citizen complaints		
	increase, the			
	number of			
	sustained citizen			
	complaints			
	decreased			
Villone (2010)	Villone found that	Data collected from a		Х
· 11010 (2010)	the hypothesis that	township police		Λ
	"higher	department in Mahoning		
	education related	County, Ohio between		
	to less criminal	2005-2009.		
	liability, was not	2003-2007.		
	supported through			
	the statistical			
	analysis"			

Brandl, Stroshine, & Frank	education is not significantly correlated with assignment, patrol area, arrests made, or complaints received.	The data for this study were collected from a large mid-western municipal police department. The population that the police department served was approximately 45 percent White and 40 percent African–American	X
Worden (1995)	found that officers with bachelor's degrees were actually more likely to use reasonable force and just as likely to use improper force as officers without bachelor's degrees.	This article digests previous research and describes those belief systems which directly affect officers' behavior. There was no survey of police agencies.	Х

Of the eleven selected studies, eight showed officers with higher education had fewer citizen and internal complaints. Three studies showed no discernible difference.

## **Summary and Conclusions**

Summarizing the Tables 8-13, the selected studies clearly indicate that a higher education requirement for police officers results in officers who excel in the six identified variables. Arguably, these six variables are the most important when considering the overall effectiveness of policing. Use of force, alone, may be the most important of the six variables, and the selected studies provided ample evidence that higher educated officers understand the magnitude of the use of force and use it less often than non-higher educated officers. The authors emphasize that one limitation to this study is the selected articles for examination were taken at random. Nevertheless, to use a jurisprudence term, "the preponderance of the evidence points to a clear and convincing correlation between having at least some college credits and out-performing high school graduates in the key identified variables." Do these articles accurately represent the findings of hundreds of articles which have studied the correlation of higher education when juxtaposed against the six identified dependent variables? We are confident that they do.

### **Recommendations**

First, the authors want to reiterate that we are not recommending that all law enforcement agencies make an AA/AS or BA/BS degree a requirement for entry-level police officer positions. Based on the findings of our study, we believe that at least an AA/AS degree is the wise choice, but we also understand the reality of this choice would result in fewer officers than is needed to make cities and counties safe. Our concern is, if the majority of new hires have only a high school diploma or GED, jurisdictions are taking additional risks. Our study revealed that officers with college credits or degrees use force less often than high school graduates. When officers use excessive force, cities and counties are subject to civil lawsuits that can cost jurisdictions millions of dollars every year. Los Angeles, for example, over a five-and-a-half-year period, paid over \$245 million to settle legal claims involving the LAPD (*Los Angeles Times*, n.d.). Moreover, it may be the case that potential applicants with college units or even a degree may not want to take a job that devalues their education.

### **Recommendation 1**

Therefore, our first recommendation is that the approximately 18,000 U.S. law enforcement agencies implement a tuition reimbursement program. Agencies should negotiate with online colleges and universities to have a law enforcement scholarship/tuition reduction program of at least 25%. The authors' university, National University—headquartered in San Diego—offers this law enforcement scholarship.

Why do we recommend online universities? Rotating shift work is not conducive to traditional, in-person, "brick and mortar" campuses. This would result in officers having to skip semesters or quarters when working the day and evening shifts. Another reason for officers to seek out online universities and colleges is that in today's hostile climate toward policing and

police officers, they may not feel comfortable being engaged in on-campus seminars. A worse case scenario would be a requirement to take a course such as the University of California, Berkeley's Sociology of Policing (Sociology 149). Three of the lectures are titled, (1) our enemy in blue, (2) cops and Klan, hand-in-hand, and (3) making police obsolete.

## **Recommendation 2**

Our second recommendation is to make a BS/BA degree a requirement for promotion to first-line supervisor (usually the rank of sergeant). This gives officers the incentive to take advantage of the tuition reimbursement program and will significantly increase the number of officers with a BS/BA degree.

## **Recommendation 3**

Our third recommendation is to recruit more aggressively on college and university campuses and specifically on Historically Black Colleges and Universities (HBCUs). Critics of requiring an AA/AS or BA/BS degree is that under-served communities will be policed predominately by Caucasian officers. Policing today is comprised of a majority of Caucasian officers, and this imbalance must be rectified and must include more representation by Hispanic officers as well.

Often overlooked with the emphasis on a BS/BA degree for police officers is that society is doing officers a favor by requiring the degree. Why is this the case? A policing career is one of the shortest as is the case with most first responder occupations. In California, the Public Employees Retirement System—Public Safety (PERS-public safety) allows a police officer to retire at age 50 at 2% of the officers salary per year. So, an officer who is hired at age 25 and retires at 50, will receive 50% of his or her average of the last three years' salary. Since the Defund the Police Movement and other protest aimed at policing, many more officers are opting

to retire at age 50 or perhaps even sooner with accrued unused sick and vacation time. With no BA/BS degree, the options for a second career other than security guard are negligible and 50% of an officer's final salary may be just enough to survive at best. This can lead to depression, alcohol abuse, and perhaps even suicide. Police officers have one of the highest suicide rates in the U.S. (Dvorak, 2021). Possessing a BS/BA degree at retirement makes the officer much more marketable in both the public and private sectors. Corporations and the public sector need corporate security officers and retail companies need supervisors for their theft reduction officers. Most community colleges will hire adjunct instructors who possess a BS/BA and have experience in law enforcement. In summary, the options for retired law enforcement personnel increase substantially for officers with a BS/BA degree.

### **Recommendation 4**

Our fourth recommendation is for agencies to end the bonuses offered to experienced officers from other agencies to "jump ship" and laterally transfer to the bonus offering agency. Police departments are not professional sport teams offering "free agency" contracts to superior athletes. Recent examples of bonuses for large metropolitan police departments are as follows: San Diego PD--\$15,000 Seattle PD--\$15,000

Washington Metropolitan PD--\$5,000

Portland PD--\$10,000

San Antonio--\$7,500

And the largest bonus among all major police departments in the US is the Alameda, California PD which is offering a \$75,000 transfer bonus.

Assuming that the Alameda, California PD, for example, needs 10 lateral transfers, this would result in a payout of \$750,000. If Alameda PD recruited 10 graduates from one or more of the California POST's 38 police academies of police academy graduates who had paid their own academy tuition, the only cost would be the expenses of the background investigation and the psychological evaluation. The \$750,000 for the Alameda PD's lateral recruitment could be better spent on tuition reimbursement, and this is the case for all other agencies offering bonuses.

This concludes the recommendations and the paper. The authors welcome any additions to this paper that we may have omitted. Here are the email addresses of the authors: jguffey@nu.edu, poliverio@nu.edu, and ngolden@nu.edu.

## References

Aamodt, M. G. (2004). Research in law enforcement selection. Universal-Publishers.

- Boss, D. (2019). Police education: An analysis of the effects of educational requirements for police officers on citizen complaints. Youngstown State University. *ProQuest Dissertations Publishing*. 28678941.
- Brandl, S.G., Stroshine, M.S., & Frank, J. (2001, November-December). Who are the complaint prone officers? An examination of the relationship between police officers' attitudes, arrest activity, assignments, and citizens' complaints about excessive force. *Journal of Criminal Justice*, 29(6), 521-529.
- Breci, M.G. (1997). What motivates officers to continue their college educations? *Journal of Criminal Justice Education*, 8(1), 51-60.
- Bruns, D., & Magnan, K. (2014). Police officer perspectives on higher education: Is the degree a necessary ingredient for the performance and behavior of police officers? *Journal of Law and Criminal Justice*, 2(2), 27-45.
- Camera, L. (2020, October 28). Reading scores fall among u.s. high school seniors. U.S. News and World Report. Retrieved on February 13, 2023, from <u>https://www.usnews.com/news/education-news/articles/2020-10-28/reading-scores-fall-among-us-high-school-seniors</u>.
- Cascio, W.F. (1977). Formal education and police officer performance. *Journal of Police Science and Administration*, 5(1), 89-96.
- Carlan, P.E., & Byxbe, F.R. (2000). The promise of humanistic policing: Is higher education living up to societal expectation? *American Journal of Criminal Justice*, 24, 235-246.
- Carter, D.L., Sapp, A.D., & Stephens, D.W. (1988). Higher education as a bona fide occupational qualification (BFOQ) for police: A blueprint. *American Journal of Police*, 7(2), 2-27.
- Carter, D.L., & Sapp, A.D. (1990). The evolution of higher education in law enforcement: Preliminary findings from a national study. *Journal of Criminal Justice Education*, 1(1), 59-85,
- Cohen, B., & Chaiken, J.M. (1972). Police background characteristics and performance. U.S. Department of Justice, Office of Justice Programs. *National Criminal Justice Reference Service*, No. 8981. Retrieved from <u>https://www.ojp.gov/ncjrs/virtual-library/abstracts/police-background-characteristics-and-performance</u>.
- Dailey, J.D. (2002). An investigation of police officer background and performance: An analytical study of the effect of age, time in service, prior military service, and education on commendations. *Sam Houston State University ProQuest Dissertations Publishing*.

- Delattre, E.J. (2002). *Character and cops*. The AEI Press: Washington, D.C. <u>https://books.google.com/books?hl=en&lr=&id=29wECCW3mtsC&oi=fnd&pg=PR13&</u> <u>dq=Delattre+2002&ots=cQCDByeEfM&sig=yCD8ICF2cRZPRIRWfgQ9K1D39Kw#v=</u> <u>onepage&q=Delattre%202002&f=false</u>.
- Deluga, R.J.; & Souza, J. (1991, March). The effects of transformational and transactional leadership styles on the influencing behavior of subordinate police officers. *Journal of Occupational Psychology*. <u>https://doi.org/10.1111/j.2044-8325.1991.tb00540.x</u>
- Dudley, J.; & Shults, J. (2022, March 22). State your case: Should prospective cops be required to have college degrees? *Police 1 by Lexipol*. Retrieved on February 13, 2023, from <u>https://www.police1.com/police-jobs-and-careers/articles/state-your-case-should-prospective-cops-be-required-to-have-college-degrees-t9MXaJOawkPBvUma/</u>
- Dvorak, P. (2021, August 9). Death by suicide among police is a quiet epidemic. It needs to be acknowledged. *The Washington Post*. Retrieved on January 4, 2024, from <u>https://www.washingtonpost.com/local/death-by-suicide-among-police-is-a-quiet-epidemic-it-needs-to-be-acknowledged/2021/08/09/c7dc2036-f941-11eb-9c0e-97e29906a970\_story.html</u>
- Edwards, B.D. (2018, September 26). Perceived value of higher education among police officers: Comparing county and municipal officers. *Journal of Criminal Justice Education*, *30*(4), 606-620.
- Finnigan, J.C. (1977, August). A study of the relationship between college education and police performance in Baltimore, Maryland. *Police Chief*, 43, 62-63.
- Harmon, N.L. (2022). An exploratory study of the perceptions of effectiveness for brazilian jiu jitsu training for law enforcement (Unpublished Master's Thesis). ProQuest Dissertation Publications.
- Hayeslip, D.W. (1989). Higher education and police performance: The evidence examined through meta-analysis. *American Journal of Police*, 8, 49-62. <u>https://heinonline.org/HOL/Page?handle=hein.journals/ajpol8&div=20&g\_sent=1&casa\_token=&collection=journals</u>.
- Hilal, S.; & Shults, J. (2013, May 7). FBI Law Enforcement Bulletin. Retrieved on February 13, 2023, from <u>https://leb.fbi.gov/articles/featured-articles/higher-education-and-local-lawenforcement.</u>
- <u>Hoopes, Z. (2023, August 28).</u> State troopers no longer need college credits, Shapiro administration announces. *Pennlive Patriot News*. Retrieved from https://www.pennlive.com/news/2023/08/state-troopers-no-longer-need-collegecredits-shapiro-administration-announces
- Hooper, M.K. (1988). The relationship of college education to police officer job performance. *The Claremont Graduate University ProQuest Dissertations Publishing*, 1988. 8901009.

- Hudjins, J.L. (2014, September 30). Require college degrees for police. *The Baltimore Sun*. Retrieved on February 13, 2023, from <u>https://www.baltimoresun.com/opinion/op-ed/bs-ed-police-degrees-20140930-story.html</u>.
- Jannazzo, E.S. (2019, June 13). What is maturity? *Psychology Today*. Retrieved on February 13, 2023, from <u>https://www.psychologytoday.com/us/blog/the-full-</u>spectrum/201906/what-is-maturity.
- Kappeler, V.E., Sapp, A.D., & Carter, D.L. (1992). Police officer higher education, citizen complaints and departmental rule violations. *American Journal of Police*, 11(2), 37-54.
- Lersch, K.M., & Kunzman, L.L. (2001). Misconduct allegations and higher education in a southern sheriff's department. *American Journal of Criminal Justice*, 25(2), 161-172. Retrieved from <u>https://link.springer.com/article/10.1007/BF02886843</u>.

## Los Angeles Times

- Manis, J., Archibold, C.A, & Hassell, K.D. (2008). Exploring the impact of police officer education level on allegations of police misconduct. *International Journal of Police Science and Management*, 10, 509-523.
- McElvain, J.P., & Kposowa, A.J. (2008, April 1). Police officer characteristics and the likelihood of using deadly force. *Criminal Justice and Behavior*, 35(4), 241-254. <u>https://doi.org/10.1177/0093854807313995</u>.

Morabito, E. V., & Doerner, W. G. (1997). Police use of less-than-lethal force: oleoresin capsicum (OC) spray. *Policing: An International Journal of Police Strategies & Management*, 20(4), 680-697.
 <a href="https://www.ojp.gov/ncjrs/virtual-library/abstracts/police-use-less-lethal-force-oleoresin-capsicum-oc-spray">https://www.ojp.gov/ncjrs/virtual-library/abstracts/police-use-less-lethal-force-oleoresin-capsicum-oc-spray</a>.

- Paoline, E., & Terrill, W. (2007). Police education, experience, and the use of force. *Criminal Justice and Behavior*, 34(2), 179-196. <u>https://doi.org/10.1177/0093854806290239</u>.
- Paterson, C. (2011). Adding value? A review of the international literature on the role of higher education in police training and education. *Police Practice and Research*, 12(4), 286-297.
- Reaves, B.A. (2012, October). Hiring and retention of state and local law enforcement officers, 2008—statistical tables, table 15, percent of state and local law enforcement agencies considering applicants with selected negative prior events. *Bureau of Justice Statistics, Law Enforcement Management and Administrative Statistics.* Retrieved on February 13, 2023, from https://bjs.ojp.gov/content/pub/pdf/hrslleo08st.pdf.
- Roberg, R. R. (1978). An analysis of the relationships among higher education, belief systems, and job performance of patrol officers. *Journal of Police Science and Administration*, 6(3), 336-344.

- Roberg, R.R., & Laramy, J.E. (1980). An empirical assessment of the criteria utilized for promoting police personnel: A secondary analysis. *Journal of Police Science and Administration*, 8(2), 183-187.
- Rogers, M. (2003). The effects of higher education on police officer performance and promotion. *The University of North Dakota ProQuest Dissertations Publishing*, 3127744.
- Rusch, K.; & DuSault, L. (2019, November 14). How did this california police department hire so many officers with troubling pasts? *The Mercury News, Crime and Public Safety*. Retrieved on February 13, 2023, from <u>https://www.mercurynews.com/2019/11/11/howdid-this-california-police-department-hire-so-many-officers-with-troubling-pasts/</u>
- Rydberg, J., & Terrill, W. (2010). The effects of higher education on police behavior. *Police Quarterly*, 13(1), 92-120. <u>https://doi.org/10.1177/1098611109357325</u>.
- Sanderson, E.B. (1977, August). The relationship of college education to job performance. *Police Chief*, 62-63.
- Sherman, L.W., & Blumberg, M. (1981). Higher education and police use of force. *Journal of Criminal Justice*, 9(4), 317-331.
- Shernock, S.K. (1992, Spring). The effects of college education on professional attitudes among police. *Journal of Criminal Justice Education*, *3*, 71-92.
- Shjarback, J.A.; & White, M.D. (2015, September 7). Departmental professionalism and its impact on indicators of violence in police-citizen encounters. *Police Quarterly*, 19(1), 32-62. <u>https://doi.org/10.1177/1098611115604449</u>.
- Smith, S.M., & Aamodt, M.G. (1997). The relationship between education, experience, and police performance. *Journal of Police and Criminal Psychology*, *12*(2), 7-14.
- Sukel, K. (2017, April 4). When is the brain "mature?" *Dana Foundation*. Retrieved on February 13, 2023, from <u>https://www.dana.org/article/when-is-the-brain-mature/</u>
- Telep, C.W. (2010, November 5). The Impact of higher education on police officer attitudes toward abuse of authority. *Journal of Criminal Justice Education*, 22(3), 392-419. <u>https://doi.org/10.1080/10511253.2010.519893</u>
- Terrill, W., & Mastrofski, S.D. (2006, August 18). Situational and officer-based determinates of police coercion. Justice Quarterly, 19(2), 215-248. <u>https://doi.org/10.1080/07418820200095221</u>.
- Terrill, W., & Ingram, J.R. (2015, October 26). Citizen complaints against the police: An eight city examination. *Police Quarterly*, 19(2), 156-181. <u>https://doi.org/10.1177/1098611115613320</u>.

- Truxillo, D.M., Bennett, S.R., & Collins, M.L. (1998, June 1). College education and police performance: A ten-year study. *Public Personnel Management*, 27(2), 269-280.
- Tyre, M., & Braunstein, S. (1992, June). Higher education and ethical policing. *The FBI Law Enforcement Bulletin, 61*(6), 10-17.
- Vespucci, J. (2019). Police officers and college education: The association of police officer college education and the level of force used by a police officer in gaining compliance in arrest situations. City University of New York. *ProQuest Dissertations Publishing*. 13810095. Retrieved from <a href="https://www.proquest.com/docview/2207722380?\_oafollow=false&pq-orgsite=primo">https://www.proquest.com/docview/2207722380?\_oafollow=false&pq-orgsite=primo</a>.
- Villone, E. J. (2010). Officers armed with degrees: Does education shield law enforcement officers from complaints? Youngstown State University Unprinted Master's Thesis. Available from Ohiolink.edu at: http://rave.ohiolink.edu/etdc/view?acc\_num=ysu1288069360.
- White M. D., & Kane R. J. (2013) Pathways to career-ending police misconduct: An examination of patterns, timing and organizational responses to officer malfeasance in the NYPD. *Criminal Justice and Behavior* 40(11): 1301–1325.
- Worden, R.E. (1990). A badge and a baccalaureate: Policies, hypotheses, and further evidence. *Justice Quarterly*, 7(3), 565-592. <u>https://doi.org/10.1080/07418829000090731</u>.
- Worden, R.E. (1995). Police officers' belief systems: A framework for analysis. American Journal of Police, 14(1), 49-64. Retrieved from <u>https://heinonline.org/HOL/LandingPage?handle=hein.journals/ajpol14&div=9&id=&page=.</u>
- Wycoff, M.A., & Susmilch, C.E. (1979). The relevance of college education for policing: Continuing the dialog. In David M. Petersen (Ed.), *Police work: Strategies and outcomes in law enforcement (pp. 17-35).* Beverly Hills: Sage.
- Wyllie, D. (2016, December 15). Police hiring standards: Raise them or lower them? *Police 1*. Retrieved from <u>https://www.police</u> 1.com/police-jobs-and-careers/articles/police-hiring-standards-raise-them-or-lower-them-IsmlclDXbVilhuSluT/
- Yancey-Bragg, N'dea. (2020, December 11). California bill would require police officers be 25 years old or have a bachelor's degree. USA Today. Retrieved on February 13, 2023, from <u>https://www.usatoday.com/story/news/nation/2020/12/11/california-police-bill-raises-age-education-requirements-cops/3893422001/</u>