Purchasing behaviors of the consumers based on ethnic identities in Turkey

Meltem Nurtaniş Velioğlu
Abant Izzet Baysal University

Süreyya Karsu
Abant Izzet Baysal University

Meftune Özbakır Umut
Abant Izzet Baysal University

ABSTRACT

This study examined the impact of ethnic identity on purchasing behavior resulting from ethnic marketing. The research was conducted among 11 ethnic groups in Düzce; a city of Turkey: Abkhazians, Albanians, Bosnians, Circassians, Cremean Turks, Georgians, Gypsies, Kurds, Lazs, Manav People and Muhajirs. Data was collected through two forms: in depth interviews with 11 ethnic groups’ male participants and focus group interviews with 11 ethnic groups’ female participants. The results indicated that the economic equality among these ethnic groups was the driving force to live in peace for centuries and that the buying behaviors of these ethnic groups varied. Food and beverage type products were found to be a mean for recognizing other cultures. This research would be helpful for the food sector-oriented development in ethnic marketing practices. In addition this research may help to identify the required ethnic tourism marketing practices depending on the ethnic groups’ cultural values and longing through ancestral lands.

Keywords: Ethnic identity, ethnic marketing, qualitative research, Turkey, interview
INTRODUCTION

Some of the scholars define ethnic marketing; nothing else than segment-marketing applied to ethnic target groups with special cultural attributes (Kulinna, 2008:3). Common denominator for ethnic marketing, said as marketing actions through subcultures whose language or culture differentiate from others and the subculturers that are pleased by serving an other way from others in society.

Ethnic marketing is related with marketing actions which are served to discern subculture’s needs and and demands. Furthermore, ethnic marketing is an action especially for subcultures who are pleased to be behaved differently from others and make product or brand preference by that way and espicially decide to purchase goods from the confidential same subculture sellers (Nurtanış Velioglu, 2005:100-101). Perhaps, the largest driving force in the need for cultural concerns in marketing has been the growth in population of a variety of ethnic groups (Deshpandé and Stayman, 1994:57).

Ethnic marketing means adjusting your marketing strategies to the values, beliefs, attitudes and practises of your target ethnic groups (Guion, Kent et al. 2010:2). There are two main questions to be answered to establish ethnic marketing strategies. First “is there similiar product needs and preferences of ethnic minorities?” Second, “are the reactions to the media and advertising to ethnic groups having any differences?”. By answering these questions there are five ways to manage successful ethnic marketing. (1) Value the cultural uniqueness of your target group. (2) Value cooperation and bridge-building with community leaders and other organizations working within the community. (3) Value the cultural beliefs, symbols, and practices of your target group. (4) Value differences in languages, accents, practices, and social conduct. (5) Value word-of-mouth and interpersonal communication to spread your message (Guion, Kent et al., 2010:2).

Determining the changes in consumer’s purchasing decision has a vital importance while attempting to create ethnic marketing strategies. Cultural differences are known as one of the elements that affect purchasing behavior. Unfortunately, it is impossible to be sure that the observed consumption behavior differences reflect cultural differences. Instead, it may well be that such demographic differences as those in income, education, age distribution, family size, or product availability are the true causes of consumption differences (Wallendorf and Reilly, 1983:292).

Ethnic identity and ethnic marketing arguments increased with the implementation of European Union’s 6th Adaptation Action Programme in Turkey. By the permission of related law, “different languages and dialects traditionally used Turkish citizens’ in daily life; attain the possibility of broadcasting, both public and private radio and television organizations through the provision of legal guarantees”. The not being present of sufficient researches in this direction, even though various researchs in the literature in Turkey pertaining to the level of the defining the ethnic identities. The ethnic identities exhibit changes in purchasing behaviours exist up until today is the starting point of the research.

LITERATURE REVIEW

Ethnic concept derived from “ethnos” word from the ancient Greek language. At the archaic period in Greece, ethnos concept illustrated the people, clans, hordes live in a harmony and shares cultural and biological properties according to common origin, birthplace, or the place where these people live (Sağır Öztoprak and Akilli, 2004:2). In addition, ethnic concept in social sciences illustrated mostly away from biological and genetic differentiation. In social science studies ethnic concept depicted as a clan’s or a social organization’s properties and a kind of social learning, social estate acceptations, owned language, religion
and owned culture which will differentiate a group from others (Gül, 2007:25). At that point ethnic identity is described as one of collective identity which is contributed at social life and a kind of identity owned by the members or appropriated by others. Furthermore, ethnic identity is indicated as a natural and universal fact that comes up a person interaction with social environment and his strict to change this group consciousness (Yılmaz, 2010:1). A person’s ethnic identity involves one’s sense of belongings to a group, as well as the feelings being part of that group. In this sense, ethnic identity is said as a complex psychological process which involves perceptions, cognition, and affect and knowledge structures about person thoughts and feels about himself and others in society (Jamal, 2003:1602). However, Zmud and Arce (1992) and Venkatesh (1995) argued ethnic identity dealt with the question “how people feel about and characterize them selves?”. On the other hand, Chattaraman and Lennon (2008) defined ethnic identity as the shared identity of a group based on a common historical background, ancestry and knowledge of identifying symbolic elements such as nationality, religious affiliation and language.

Ethnic identity concept is based on emic perspective, that how the group define and characterize it self. From a philosophy of academic evolution, ethnic identity includes the self acknowledgment and acceptance how the person thinks and feels himself (Õnder, 2007:5). Forehand and Deshpandé (2001) called emic perspective as “ethnic self-awareness”, a temporary state during which a person is more sensitive to his or her ethnicity. All the same, ethnic identity is something about person’s self-definition (O’Guinn and Faber, 1986:138).

Stayman and Deshpandé (1989) suggested that individual ethnicity should measure in terms of both trait ethnicity (membership of an ethnic group, strength of ethnic identification) and situational ethnicity. They presented ethnicity not just “who one is, but also how one feels in and about a particular situation”. Hence, a consumer’s social surroundings would help to determine how ethnic group feels (Deshpandé and Stayman, 1994:58). Culture is defined emically as the lens through which all phenomena are seen. It determines how these phenomena are apprehended and assimilated. It is the blueprint of human activity. It determines the coordinates of social action and productive activity (McCracken, 1988: 73). The advantage of emic approach promotes a complete understanding of the culture of study through deep understanding from an insider. Cultural differences are one of the factor affect purchasing behavior. And, demographic differences are the true causes of consumption differences.

Before culture can be employed in a causal explanation, controls are needed for these other factors (Wallendorf and Reilly, 1983:292). End of discussions Ogden, Ogden and Schau (2004) predicated a basic microcultural purchasing outcome model including identification of microcultures. They suggested the purchase outcome of microcultures was moderated by two variables; the degree of consumer acculturation and the type of product under consideration. General model is shown in Figure1.

**Figure 1: Microcultural Purchase Outcome Model**

![Figure 1: Microcultural Purchase Outcome Model](image_url)

Ogden, Ogden and Schau (2004) suggested the differences in consumer purchase
behaviors on the consumer’s microculture. These differences determined by anthropological, sociological and psychological studies in consumer research (Ogden, Ogden et al., 2004:7-9) and psychographic characteristics examined in the ethnic structure is the basis of the our study.

Identifying of microcultures is the first step of microcultural purchase outcome model and the process goes by determining the degree of consumer acculturation. Three trends appear in consumer acculturation studies (Ogden, Ogden et al., 2004:9-10): (1) The concepts of ethnic identity. This trend increase use of ethnic identity to classify ethnic groups. Self-identification of ethnicity through assignment to an ethnic group is based on indicators such as surname, area of residence or city and how they perceive themselves in these residence or cities and the definition of ethnic identity based on their own acknowledge. (2) Strenght of ethnic affiliation trend increase reliance on the degree of ethnic affiliation, which was inspired by Padilla (1980) as “ethnic loyalty”. Ethnic loyalty is defined as language, staying time in host country, race, and religion and media sources, on the basis of the preferences of individuals from other cultures as much as cultural acculturation. (3) Situational ethnicity trend reflects development in consumer acculturation research called as situational ethnicity or felt ethnicity.

Based on the model, degree of consumer acculturation moderates the relationship between microcultures and purchase decisions. The degree of acculturation moderates the purchase outcome. Thus, the higher degree of acculturation the less similar the purchase result with other members of microculture. Furthermore, the extent to which a microculture reacts to marketing is moderated by the degree of acculturation, which the less likely the reliance on marketing tactics for product information (Ogden, Ogden et. al., 2004:11).

PURPOSE

In Turkey, discussions on “ethnic groups” are generally composed of political nationalidm literature. The purpose of this research focuses on discussing “ethnic groups” from ethnic marketing literature keeps off political nationalism. Ethnic marketing, is not only the development of products that are special to a certain ethnic sub group, but it is also the product of a unifying understanding the meaning of accepting and favoring of the products that are belonging to all consumers of the ethnic groups.

The research within this frame carries the purpose of determination of the existing situation which will form a base to ethnic marketing by putting forward the effects of the ethnic identity over purchasing behaviors. Apart from this, the research will bring in clarity to the questions “why the ethnic sub cultures try to leave the base cultural structure, whether things are present or not that we can not access with a general marketing understanding with society direction together with whether the ethnic groups carrying a similar trend at the level of purchasing behaviors”.

Lamont and Molnár (2001) suggested in their reseach whether there was a difference in the purchasing behaviors of the people who had different ethnic identities. They observed that the ethnic groups who live in U.S.A. purchase expensive and specialty goods mostly for being respected and for the purpose of showing their statuses high. Another study by Lindridge and Dibb (2002) suggested that the purchasing behaviors changed at the ethnic identity level. They observed that the ethnic groups who provided more adaptation to the dominant culture and the ethnic groups less adaptation to the dominant culture and that are weak from the point of view of economics have different consumptiation habits from each other. Mangan, Mendonça et al. (2008) defined, in the direction of cthnic products that grows together with the increasing of the purchasing power of the consumers in U.S.A. who had different ethnic identities put forward the number of the markets which especially were
belonging to ethnic groups and local foods and drinks belonging to those ethnic groups in these markets were being sold.

RESEARCH QUESTIONS

The base research questions within this frame were “what we desire to get at the ethnic identities level and in the direction of purchasing behavior?” and “what do we aim to find?” in Düzce city. Düzce city is the place where comprise of different ethnic groups and the city received great amounts of migration during the Ottoman - Russian wars (1877 - 1878). Düzce, quite a number of ethnic groups live together and the expression of “71, 5 nations live in our city” is being spent among the people. The first question is “what nation are you from?” when people get to know each other and where such questions are not find absurd, almost a map of Turkey is observed. A small city of Turkey where people live in peace since centuries.

The research questions determined in the following manner by depending on the literature within the frame of such base questions: (1)How is the way of defining the members of the different ethnic groups themselves? (2) Do the purchasing behaviors of the consumers that have different ethnic identities exhibit changes? (3) What are the factors that affect the purchasing behavior at the ethnic identities level? (4) Are there any products that the consumers think help to reflect their ethnic identities? (5) What are the approaches against the cultural products of other ethnic groups?

METHODOLOGY

11 ethnic groups were targeted in this research. These groups were identified in one of the The Scientific and Technological Research Council of Turkey’s (TÜBİTAK) project (Kümbeoğlu, Yarar et al., 2007:347-350) which was completed in 2007. These groups are: Abkhazians, Albanians, Bosnians, Circassians, Cremean Turks, Georgians, Gypsies, Kurds, Lazs, Manav People and Muhajirs in alphabetical order (for depth interviews’ and focus group interviews’ demographical structures see Appendix A-B).

One of the important criteria which were used in providing the validity and reliability in qualitative research is triangulation. Denzin wrote a justification for triangulation in 1970 and credited by some with initiating the move toward integrated research that mixes methods. Denzin developed a more systematic approach of triangulation for social research.

There are four types of triangulation: data triangulation refers to the use of different data sources which should be distinguished from the use of different methods for producing data. Investigator triangulation requires that different observers or interviewers are employed to detect or minimize biasis resulting from the researchers as a person. Theory triangulation is the third type of Denzin’s systematolgy that refers “approaching data with multiple perspectives and hypotheses in mind”. As the fourth type, Denzin mentions methodological triangulation, in which, two subtypes should be differentiated: within-method and between triangulation (Denzin, 1989:237-241). Researchers interested in using the potential of triangulation should include different researchers (investigator triangulation), either working in collaboration or independently. Ideally they would bring in different theoretical perspectives, which will lead one of the versions of methodological (with or between methods) triangulation. The result would be a triangulation of different sorts of data, which then allows a systematic triangulation perspectives, if theoretical backrounds and different aspects of the phenomenon under study are included in the approach (Flick, 2007:51).

Triangulation is less a strategy for validating results and procedures than an alternative to validation (Flick, 2009:445). This research was carried out with two different data collection
methods for the purpose of data collection with different methods among different individuals and the media as per the requirement of triangulation. In depth interviews (DI) which lasted approximately 1 - 1.5 hours were made with male participants who were presumed to have the specialty of representing the 11 ethnic groups at the first data collection phase on separate basis. Whereas focus group interviews (FGI) were done with female participants of between 6 – 8 people, as proposed by Morgan (1998) and Finch and Lewis (2005). The focus group interviews lasted approximately 1, 5 – 2 hours. These interviews were presumed to have the specialty of representing again 11 ethnic groups at the second data collection phase on separate basis. Snow ball sampling method was used among the sampling methods. This approach is especially effective in the determination of the in individuals or situations that would prove to be a rich source of information pertaining to the problem (Yıldırım and Şimşek, 2003:64-73). Though the subject of exploratory qualitative research is everyday knowledge, the knowledge desired is best described as prescientific. The rationale of exploratory focus groups is that considering a problem in terms of everyday explanation will somehow facilitate a subsequent scientific approach (Calder, 1977:356).

The process started with the question “who can be the source of most of the information in this regard?”. This question formed the base of the snow ball sampling method and the process realized with the names that emerged in the forefront DIs that form the first data collection phase of the research as the process advances. Later on process realized with the different individuals and the media took place again within the 11 ethnic groups female participants FGIs, comprise of 6 – 8 people and also determined again with the snow ball sampling method for accessing through different data collection methods. Each focus group in the formation of focus groups formed out of female who had the same ethnic identity and known each other and hence being homogenous provided with having the specialty of similar and fit to each other that participants tend to feel safer with, and may prefer being with, others who share similar characteristics (Finch and Lewis, 2005:190). The FGIs were performed in the participants’ houses or the out side places as cafeterias where they would fell better. The focus group presents a more natural environment than that of the individual interview because participants are influencing and influenced by others just as they are in real life (Krueger and Casey, 2000:11). The photographs which were taken at homes / business places of each one of the ethnic groups in the name of reinforcing the triangulation and assessing the results in this manner from different dimensions and the written impression notes made use of.

Joppe (2011) provided what validity is in qualitative research as, validity determines whether the research truly measures that which it was intended to measure or how truthful the research results are. Researchers generally determine validity by asking a series of questions, and will often look for the answers in the research of others. In the forming of the external and internal reliability of the research as LeCompte and Goetz (1982) suggested, the researchers put forward in priority their own position (like observation fellow, participant). The specialities of the people who are the source of data put forward in a clear matter. The social medium in the research process defined. The literature supports the provided findings. Data collection and analysis methods were given in a detailed manner, in the forming of the external reliability. Data directly presented in priority with a descriptive approach. The same research was carried out with three researchers. The research realized personally at the locations of the data sources themselves and the interviews and the findings which were obtained through the way of observation confirmed. The supports of three researchers and an assistant researcher from outside provided in the analysis of the data, in the provision of the internal reliability.

Research question should be of sufficient scope as to be resolvable with resources available, not involved in proving right or wrong and stated in such a way as to define clearly
the problem to be investigated. Therefore, research questions can be categorized based on the nature and purpose of the resulting study (Black, 2005:30-31).

Care was exhibited for being easily understandable, with focusing, with open end and that can not be directed of the questions as also put forward by Krueger and Casey (2000:12) while the research questions were prepared and alternative questions against any question that was not understandable during data collection prepared with the same question format for the DIs and the FGIs.

The interview periods extended by the researchers for certain limits for the FGIs compared to the DIs, even though the asking of questions for the FGIs as much as for the DIs were not possible and replies were tried to be obtained to all of the questions. While a researcher acted as a moderator in the interview, the other two researchers took notes on separate basis and portable tape recorders by taking the permission of the participants one by one (the members of the Gypsy ethnic group rejected to use voice recorder in the DI) and thus the ideal situation use provided. A major use of the portable tape recorder is for the systematic recording of replies in the more open or intensive kind of interview. The recorder has distinct advantages in this situation. It leaves the interviewer free to concentrate on the interview itself and it eliminates problems of memory failure and of selectivity by the interviewer. The tape recorder can also be used to find out what the interviewer interprets as correct interviewing procedure when in the field—a process of discovery that can provide shocks for the research executive (Belson, 1967:253).

Apart from this, the research supported with the observation notes and various photographs. In the name of supporting of the interview methods even though the observation method was not used as an independent method and in the name of providing detailed / additional explanations pertaining to the formation that forms the subject of the research and in the name of explaining of the behaviors within their very own media (Yıldırım and Şimşek, 2003:122-137). One example of convergence occurs when the researchers observe an event or hear a person say something in a conversation, checking eachother if all of them observe or hear the same thing, and both draw the same conclusion. (The typical conversation between the researchers after leaving the event or conversation with the other person, begins with one of saying “Did you see what I saw?” or “Did you hear what I heard?”). The more researchers can show such convergence, especially on key findings, the stronger your evidence. Use of the term triangulating points to the ideal situation when evidence from three different sources converge. For instance, researchers saw something, someone else also at the scene saw the same thing, and a news article later reported the same thing (Yin, 2011:153).

“What is your ethnic identity?” or as used in day-to-day language in Düzce “what nation are you from?” are kind of questions which are not forming of a barrier and are not being found absurd in Düzce city. The not forming of a barrier in keeping their identities confidential was supported by the preliminary research.

DATA ANALYSIS

The descriptive analysis method was used in the data analysis. Two researchers took notes in the data analysis process; put the data into the electronic medium on separate basis. Then all three researchers provided the control of all of the interviews by conveying these into the electronic medium by depending on the data in tape recorders altogether for the unification of the notes and for the provision of the integrity of these. Note taking (and later reworking your field notes) is likely to be the dominant mode of recording when doing qualitative research. The note-taking mode therefore receives the most attention. The peculiar challenge is that the researchers will have to take notes (or otherwise record your field data)
while being an active participant in the field, as well as observing and listening to what is going on. The researchers will not have the luxury of the laboratory or the classroom, where the researchers can quietly take notes at a desk (Yin, 2011:156).

All three researchers carried out the data analysis process on joint basis and by discussing the matters in multilateral manner.

FINDINGS

The following findings realized by depending on the research questions:

1. Identification of Different Ethnic Groups’ Members of Themselves:

The research started with the question “how do 11 ethnic groups who live in the Düzce city define themselves?”. All of the participants answered the question “to which ethnic group are you a member of?” and the question “what nation are you from?” as used in Düzce is being directed to them within this scope to put their ethnic identities without any hesitation in a clear manner and with pride in majority.

For example, a Circassian participant in the DI defined his identity as: “I am saying with self praise that I am a Circassian. Circassian, as known under the name of Circassian in Turkey, is called by us as Adyghe. My mother and my father both are in the manner of Circassian”.

A Georgian participant said “I am Georgian. The Georgian people define themselves in Caucasia as Kart Fedi Ena; they do not say Georgian because Russian people call them Georgian”. In such a way in his expression was extending up to the way of expressing in their own languages along with being very definitive of the identity definition of the participants and also stressed most of the times the sub ethnic identity discrimination.

Another subject attracted attention in the research within the scope of the related question was the realizing of the defining of the ethnic identity of all of the participants by putting forward their identities as they felt. For example, a Kurd participant in DI expressed his ethnic identity by saying “My mother is a Circassian and my father is a Kurd. I feel myself as a Kurd. Everyone calls me as Kurd Tuncay in Düzce”. A Cremean Turk participant in FGI said “I feel myself as a Cremean Turk”.

However, the Gypsies were behaved in the most hesitant manner among these groups in expressing their ethnic identity. Gypsies put forward that they feel themselves as being expelled as compared to other ethnic groups, where they were misunderstood both in the DI’s and FGIs on continuous basis. They were not recognized and they could not comfortably express themselves due to this reason. Only a daughter in law among the Gypsies in FGI from Mersin expressed her feelings by saying “I feel myself as a Gypsy “in a clear manner. Along with this, all of the ethnic groups were able to put forward their ethnic identities in a clear manner.

Furthermore, all ethnic groups had self capabilities of being quite honest about telling ethnic identities. They usually prefered to call each other by their ethnic identities and even their hanging labels onto their business places that expressed their ethnic identities was a finding with importance that emerged.

A Bosnian participant who had business place in the DI expresses as follows: “When I introduce with someone I prefer to use my nickname as Bosnian Ömer. I do not prefer to use my name and surname as Ömer Tokaliç. Our surname was Tokaliç in Yugoslavia and here also. I did not even change my surname”. Apart from this, it was also observed in DI’s interviews that, some of the names of business places were selected from ethnic identities of them as, “Bosnians Shaft Balance” and “Albanian Brothers Meatball”.

Purchasing behaviors, page 8
2. Purchasing Behaviors of Consumers who have Different Ethnic Identities:

     The question in the direction for putting forward “whether the purchasing behaviors of consumers who have different ethnic identities changed or not perceived in different manners which helped to reflect ethnic groups’ cultural differences/ specialties in general. For example, Laz DI participant expressed his feelings by generalizing his very own group from the point of view of purchasing by saying “Lazs make their expenditures in a careful manner. We affect the purchasing by thinking future. We like to save up money for our children’ futures. This is not of much importance in other ethnicities. I have many Circassian friends who are not like Lazs, in the matter of expenditures. Circassians pay much money for clothing and entertainment for example. They do not like to save up money for future. They fall into economical bottleneck and they become helpless; they sell their goods, properties to solve these economical problems. We, the Laz people, affect the expenditures for clothing and entertainment etc. in a careful manner. As says in Turkish adage, “augment one’s income”. We do not care much for “only ourselves”, the most important thing is our children’ futures. These are not of importance in other ethnicities. For example, I bought my house before I bought my car, accomodation is more important than private transportain in my daily life. Abkhaz people are fond of making impression but Lazs have no such thing. Laz people are far from making impression. For example, Abkhaz people may not have money in their pockets, but their mobile telephones of them are of the newest model”.

     Whereas the Bosnian participants in the FGI, put forward their purchasing behaviors by stressing the life style of their ethnic group, “the other ethnic groups say for Bosnian people that, Bosnians like strolling around, making purchases, do not stay at home. Yes, we, the Bosnians, put on nice clothes and like to buy various things but have not the brand obsession. We are diligent. We do not even buy fruit juice as ready made. We prepare hand made fruit juice at home. We even dye our hair by ourselves. I do not leave the lights on. Although I have five pairs of shoes I love to take sixth. The other ethnic groups like to talk only about, for example our shoes, they do not want to talk about saviness parts of us”.

     65 percent of the participants both in the FGIs and Dis in the research stressed the purchasing behaviors of the Circassian people who pay importance rather to their external appearances, dress and finery. This situation was provided by the answers of Circassian people in FGIs and Dis by themselves. However, Circassian people told that purchasing behavior in pride and joy but others were in a negative valueing.

     It was also put forward in the research that the ethnic identities had another difference at purchasing amounts of goods, especially on consumption goods. The realization of the purchases by the women in all 11 ethnic groups caused this question to be brought to the forefront along with it in weight in the FGIs and the assessments intensified on the amounts of the purchases.

     It was determined in FGIs that Lazs, Kurds, Muhajirs and the Albanians realized multiple purchases at one time; Cremean Turks and the Georgians realized small sized and frequent purchases on the contrary.

     For example, the Albanian participants put forward their reflections in their purchasing behaviors by saying that their most important specialty was “keeping food stock at home” that differs from other cultures in connection to the poverty degrees that they had lived in their ancestral lands and during the immigration before they migrated to Turkey. Whereas the Kurds put forward their reflections in their purchasing behaviors by saying “We, the Kurds like to buy in large sacks; we love buying in sacks”.

Purchasing behaviors, page 9
3. Factors that Affect the Purchasing Behaviors at the Level of Ethnic Identities:

The participants provided replies to the question “what are the factors that affect the purchasing behaviors at the level of ethnic identities?” within the frame of both their ethnic identities and their demographic specialties.

While all of the members of 11 ethnic groups who took place in DIs comprise of employed male consumers and their providing of replies to the question rather on the industrial market base in the purchases created this situation. Whereas being female and mostly the house wives in weight of the 11 ethnic groups again in FGIs caused to consider the replies in assessing the purchasing behavior to be focused on the consumption products.

However, one point at which all of the participants met on joint basis were the being sought of the situation of the enterprise those sellers to be from Düzce become prior item in purchasing decision in the direction of the needs. This finding was the joint denominator for all of the participants. For example, Manav participant in DI explained this situation as “I buy a refrigerator and I would like to buy it from a native seller from Düzce, in case I happen to know the identity of the seller. We, the natives, wish to purchase from each other. The important thing if the seller is from Düzce or not? It does not matter whether he is a Laz or a Circassian. I would like to buy from an old native of Düzce, even though its price is a bit different”. Whereas the Bosnian participants in FGI said “We affect purchases from the natives for the money not to go out of Düzce”. A Bosnian participant in FGI pointed out the importance of being from Düzce in purchasing decision and added “I never buy from this market, we even do not enter from its gate” by giving the name of a French retailer chain in the food sector.

“Being from the same ethnic group “was accepted as a second factor which affects purchasing behavior mostly in all ethnic groups except Abkhazian, Muhajir and the Gypsy DIs”. This situation was a point which was rather being stressed by the male participants in DIs. For example, the Georgian participant in DI expressed the situation by saying “Purchasing behavior is not very easy, but if I am to buy a product and if a Georgian sells this product, then I prefer to by from him. I would like a Georgian to earn in case the conditions are close to equal (in case the being of the price a little higher can be tolerated)”. Whereas another Albanian DI, participant on the other hand said “I buy from my own ethnicity. The small grocers in the past were Albanian. If they have been present also now, I would prefer an Albanian”. Whereas a Cremean Turk participant in DI said in a qualitative manner that supported the situation “I prefer to buy from a Cremean Turk among two identical products for both paying a visit and for affecting a trade”. A Bosnian participant in DI said “I do not consider the price, in case the quality is equal and I buy from a Bosnian. I buy from my own ethnicity, since we suffered a lot. I put myself in lieu of him”.

Whereas the replies of FGIs’ participants where majority of them comprise of female (82 percent) and mostly the housewives to the same question are as follows: Abkhazians, Circassians, Georgians, Kurds, Muhajirs and Gypsies state that they did not proceed in the way of discrimination on the basis of ethnic identity in their purchasing behaviors and they affect preferences that put forward the quality together with the price in the forefront.

Whereas Albanian, Bosnian, Laz, Manav and the Cremean Turk participants remained outside this prefer the owners of the business places are of their very own ethnic identities.

Another interesting determination emerged within the scope of this question was the base factor that changed the preferences of the consumers was the religious community/ sect fact. For example, while Georgian participant in DI said “The relationships in the social life have also deteriorated along with the religious communities, sects. Religious communities, sects have risen in the subject matter of purchasing from the 1970s onwards. Religious communities prefer to trade with each other. This property is existent in Düzce also.
Religious communities, sects carry out this business on the axis of the religion. Being Georgian, Circassian is lifted when the communities are on the religion axis”, whereas the Kurd participant in DI stated his views by saying “A sect’s conscience is one of importance in purchasing and not the ethnic identity. Sects get hold of the industry also and many of the religious communities’ leaders are Kurds. Ethnicity or sects, non of them have any importance for me, I buy from my closest neighbor at all times. At the moment the hazelnut, Turkish bagel, civil construction, clothing and apparel and the furniture sectors in Düzce at the moment belong to Kurds. The economical power is in the hands of Kurds”. Whereas the Manav participant in FGI specified in the form of “The sects started to expand in Düzce. Purchasing behaviors are being affected by the sects. Sects have schools, dormitories and they are in solidarity in trade also”. In the same way, the Bosnian participant in the FGI stressed with importance that the religious communities extensions emerged in the forefront rather than the ethnic factors in the purchasing behavior by saying “I was not thinking in this manner up to a recent time, but religious community discrimination has become of more importance rather than being a nation when the turban discrimination had started. People try to develop each other when they are of the same sect “.

4. Products which Reflect the Ethnic Identities of the Consumers:

All of the participants except the Circassian group responded within the scope of samples in the direction of the food sector to the question “are products which are considered to reflect the ethnic identities of the consumers or not”. Circassian participants put forward that they express themselves by realizing purchasing within the frame of clothing and apparel and the household goods. In this regard by saying “Circassian people mostly buy clothes and apparel and the household goods”. All other ethnic groups on the other hand assessed the “food products” to reflect the ethnic identities of their very own cultures. The following statements were provided as the common result of both the DIIs and also the FGIs as samples. Laz people: “We like to eat our own meals as, cabbage, pickles, corn bread, mihlama– a kind of meal prepared by corn flour- and the anchovy”. Albanian participants: “We get fed with meat in weight, cheese and yoghurt are also among our basic foods, but we have pastries with specific grasses also. Apart from this, we know use butter we do not use any other liquid oil / margarine”. Manav participants: “There are certainly kashkê- is a sort of meat and wheat found in old Turkich cuisine -hôşmerim- is a desert prepared by sugar and cheese- and tirît –a kind of popara- specialties present on the table when you go to a Manav village”. Georgian participants: “We eat black cabbage without tallow with corn and with butter, with pumpkin”. Crimean Turk participants: “The rights of Tatars are meat and Turkish Rakî”, Kurd participants: “We make a kind of Turkish pastry named as gözleme, hand made macaroni and a kind of phyllo named as yufka”, Gypsies: “We do not eat a meal without meat”, Muhajirs: “We make pumpkin with sugar named as titrek desert –blancmange- out of starch and potato mix thick soup with pepper”.

5. Behavior of Ethnic Groups through other Ethnic Groups’ Cultural Products:

Not all of the participants exhibited a directly negative behavior towards the question “what is your approach towards the cultural products of other ethnic groups?” except Circassian groups. Circassian participant in FGI replied “I do not like the products of different ethnic groups. The thing what we call as the product is naturally a subject of liking. We do not like the meals cooked by Manavs or Kurds. Clothing, appearance and being elegant are very important for us. Nationalistic Circassian people never buy a product of
another culture”, again by taking the clothing to the center as a product of ethnic culture.

Those products which are considered to reflect the ethnic group for all of other participants were with food weight and they stated they sometime tried and consumed these products but they did not like them through the following sentences:

Laz participant in DI said, “I taste the products of other ethnicities. I like to eat the cheese products of the Circassians’ ”, Georgian participant in DI said, “I like to try the tastes, food of different cultures “, Albanian participant in DI told, “We eat the meals of other cultures, but we do not cook them in our homes, we do not desire them”.

Muhajir participants from FGI said “We are not accustomed to, we eat, but we do not wish these to be present to eat”. Bosnian participants from FGI told, “We eat every kind of meal but we do not cook at home”, whereas the Gypsies: “Gypsies eat whatever they find”.

RESULTS

Jamal (2003) explained ethnic identity as a complex process that is in connection to how the person feels himself, owned genetically or that can be defined with the desire of belonging to a social group. Zmud and Arce (1992) and Venkatesh (1995) explained ethnic identity as how the person feels and defines himself. The defining of 11 ethnic groups live in Düzce city ethnic identities’ in a clear and most of the times with pride in connection to how they feel themselves, when the research findings are observed have the qualitative properties which supported by Jamal (2003), Zmud and Arce (1992) and Venkatesh (1995).

The determination of the ethnic identity is being specified by the personal disclosure of the person by himself according to O’Guinn and Faber (1986) and the basic thing in the definition in the ethnic identity is “what” and “who” the person see himself according to his acceptance through Önder (2007). In other words, the emic perspective. In Düzce city, it is possible to observe emic perspective as ethnic group members define themselves. Furthermore, as ethnic group members define others emic perspective also emerges. Beside, where the boundaries are separated with definitive lines with a powerful ethnic identity but that can live together in a peaceful manner together with seeing respect with much more expensive and goods with specialty, accepting the power of sight.

Cui (1997) explained that the developing of ethnic marketing strategies should start with the question “whether the needs and the product preferences are similar or not”. The base questions which form our research were “whether the purchasing behaviors of the consumers exhibit change at the ethnic identities level” and “what are the elements that affect their purchasing behaviors, in case a change is present under such a situation” as Cui (1997) maintained in his research. The findings of our research put forward that, the purchasing behaviors create differentiation on type of the purchased products and the amount of the expenditures in the ethnic groups comprise of business males and females (majority of housewives). This result has the qualification of supporting the results obtained by Cui (2001), Lamont and Molnár (2001), Lindridge and Dibb (2002) and Mangan, Mendonça et al. (2008).

The subject result causes purchases in exhibiting of a change in the dimensions of the industrial market (for business males) and consumption market (female, majority of housewives) along with it. The being scarce of the purchases in the industrial markets but the amounts of the purchases sizeable may be seen as a reason of preferring the work places that have their own ethnic identities of the participants in product purchases. This situation has the qualification of supporting also the result of “the business place of an ethnic group member is being preferred by the people who are from their own ethnic group” as put forward by Smith (2009). Apart from this, the companies from various ethnic groups members make use of relational marketing for their own ethnic groups and they realize...
marketing strategies as emerged in the research of Altunay and Altunay (2008).

The determination of the purchasing decisions of the consumers in a subculture from the degree of providing compliance from the culture of the host country to a new environment and in connection to the product type explained by Ogden, Ogden and Schau (2004) overlaps with the purchasing behavior of the consumer’s market in our research. Consumers from different ethnic identities whom try to adapt to the location where they born and live, give priority to “be from Düzce” rather than the ethnic identity, with the framework of the purchasing behavior. The ethnic groups, whose ancestors migrated to Düzce once and who were born in Düzce, adapted the location and realized a purchasing behavior with an upper identity as said “being from Düzce.” The purchasing behavior differentiated on the basis of product specialties and religious community/ sect factors.

The most important point for the consumer’s market outside the local sellers is the price and the quality of the product. Reflection of ethnic identity is not observed in this regard. However, the findings indicate that one of the most important factors directs the purchasing behavior is the extension of “religious community/ sect”, which is accepted as an ethnic identity element in concept of religion. International researchs made by Sheikh and Thomas (1994), Doka (1996), Iannaccone (1998) are on accessing the people that live in foreign countries and who have different beliefs on the basis of a religion with the strategies of target market selection when literature, even though there are great number of researches with the base of religion in ethnic marketing. The dominant factor which changes purchasing behaviours in both consumer and industrial markets is found as being from the same religious community or sect. This situation may create a result where such kind of purchasing behaviors will increase even more in close future.

Cultural values of ethnic groups can affect their purchasing behaviors or not? is a subject of curiosity for researchers. Culture, the knowledge that people have learned as members of a group, can not be observed directly. If we want to find out what people know, we must get inside their heads (Spradley, 1980:7-8). Lindridge and Dibb (2002) determined the affects of cultural values on purchasing behaviors of ethnic groups who live in the U.K. They put forward, symbol products which reflect ethnic groups’ own cultures affect the members of the ethnic groups in their research. Laroche, Kim and Tomiuk (1998) realized in their study, on Italians living in Canada, that the Italian people see the regional meals as an element which reflects their own ethnic identity. Chung and Fischer (1999) realized in their study, on Chinese people living in Canada, that the Chinese people prefer local products. Apart from this, the research of Jamal (1998) pertained to whether the eating and drinking habits of different ethnic groups living in the U.K. exhibit a change or not. This research’s result was in the direction of these differentiate on the base of ethnic groups. The research of Jamal (1998) reached the result on cultural value; the ethnic groups keep alive mostly on ethnic food consumption. Similar to the related researches, product groups which are considered to reflect the ethnic identity in Düzce city are present. 80 percent of these product groups among these do intensify over samples have the direction towards food. Whereas the remaining 20 percent ratio of these product groups are in the form of clothing and apparel together with the white goods.

In our research, consumers are willing and curious to try the products which are considered to reflect the culture of ethnic groups’ identity on the matter of the approaches of other groups. However they have no search on the basis of continuity like their own cultural products have been reached at. This result is stressed on ethnic groups’s tolerance and being volunteer for learning different cultural values of ethnic groups who live in peace and in a harmony in Düzce since centuries. Verbeke and López (2005) also supported in a similar way, they put forward the food products are barely a consumption means but they at the same time are the means of knowing different cultures. Because, according to Verbeke and
López (2005), the ethnic foods are an expression of the culture, values, customs and the beliefs of the ethnic groups.

The interview notes which were recorded within the frame of the research questions for the Düzce city, written impression notes and the results which are supported with the photographs taken in the own locations of each and every ethnic group is summarized in the following manner:

Marketing professionals need to estimate free from bias and negative images on ethnic groups to apply ethnic marketing strategies in daily life as put forward by Burton (2002) like the providing of the interviews with the Gypsy ethnic group in Düzce city with great difficulty and also their putting forward this situation in a clear manner. Differentiations on purchasing behaviors were observed among the ethnic groups in Düzce city. This result supports the idea of ability of accessing consumers through different communications means and through different products by developing a wholly new marketing mixture on the basis of ethnic foods was put forward in “marketing strategies which are developed towards ethnic consumers” matrix by Cui (1997). From that point of view it seems possible to emerge ethnic marketing on ethnic food products, it is not so easy to have trade/ sales power on ethnic food products in Düzce where a very small city is. However, the result of marketing ethnic food products in Düzce city will not be much successful emerges even though it may be considered that ethnic marketing may be realized in life on food sector focus. The fact that all the participants made ethnic foods reflect their own cultures by themselves in their very own houses. Even these hand made foods do not resemble to the ethnic foods products which their ancestors had once produced in their ancestral lands was a joint result. Beside, most of participants like to visit their ancestral lands at least once per year, they like to take materials which are especially needed for preparing the foods which reflect their own cultures and own tastes. This may prove to be enlighten to the marketing professionals in directing them towards the future.

Bosnian FGI: “The meals which are made here do not take place of their originals. For example, the meat which is dried with fume is raw. Even the animals and the meat are different in our ancestral lands. We tried to make in Düzce, but its taste is not the same as the original. My sister in law opened a Bosnian Pastry shop but she could not save the business”. The forming of a system that will provide the supply of the materials from their ancestral lands towards preparing food on the basis of foods and drinks of the ethnic groups in this direction can propose for marketing professionals.

The priority can be realized on the basis of food raw materials and auxiliary materials in case the ethnic marketing may be practiced in life in Düzce city.

The elements to form ethnic identity such as religion, language and life style, was in language, life style and religion basis on sects order in Düzce city was observed. All participants were able to speak the languages which are pertaining to their own ethnic groups beside Turkish language. They got pleased when they were addressed in their ethnic group language. This situation shows that the priority in ethnic marketing in the future can emerge to be in the forefront place at communicational dimension.

The participants around 50 years of age, hope from new generations of their ethnic groups to value and live their ethnic cultures. These participants used to visit their ancestral lands at least once per year, this can enlight marketing professionals to emphasize on “ethnic tourism marketing”.

The ethnic identities of the Düzce city were put forward in a clear manner both with an “emic perspective” and also in an “ethnic perspective”. This situation did not create a separation in the social level. This point facts the importance and priority of “being from Düzce” point rather than their priority to their ethnic identities. This station can direct marketing professionals out from political view on ethnic groups in Turkey. This result will
also support our research’s one purpose.

In protecting the peaceful coexistence in the Düzce city was based on economical balances was another result. The balanced development in the economical situations, nearl, among all ethnic groups in the city those remain outside the Gypsies. Being “tolerant” and “respectful” to all ethnic groups was the joint result of all of our participants’ views and our observations. This result supports Lindridge and Dibb (2002) study on “the consumption habits of the ethnic groups that are weak in economical terms are different” idea.

In Turkey marketing professionals need to discuss the concept of ethnic marketing a way from political nationalism view. As required in ethnic marketing definition, ethnic marketing points out a system where people speak and understand their own languages. Ethnic marketing comprehend the people who are pleased to be called in their ethnic language and who pleased to trade with the people whom feel confident towards them.

Even though there are such kinds of ethnic groups in the Düzce city, it is possible to see the effects of factors on provision of adaptation of the people to the environment that has been put forward in the purchasing model as said in the research of the Ogden, Ogden and Schau (2004). The members of the ethnic groups that live in Düzce provided adaptation to the place where they live since centuries. And they give priority in their purchasing decisions to the location where they commonly live and where they have been born. Furthermore, these ethnic groups like the others and new generation to own and respect their ethnic cultural properties. Marketing professionals can benefit from marketing supplementary on cultural marketing. At this point, ethnic marketing strategy should be configured as serving ethnic products to all sub groups. This strategy also carries the meaning of favoring of these as the product of a unifying understanding, and not to the development of special products of only a certain ethnic sub group of the ethnic marketing approach. This situation may transform into heredity where different cultures live in Turkey of the ethnic marketing approach, in case advancement can be provided with correct steps and that are far from the political platform.

Düzce city seems just like a marbling art, which were handled within the scope of the research, has almost an appearance of a map of Turkey that reflects living in harmony and in a peaceful manner. In an unplanned interview with Düzce Cultural and Social Affairs Manager expressed “there are no separations among the ethnic groups in the city as a mosaic through not any ethnic identity at all. On the contrary, Düzce reaches to the beauty of living in harmony like the marbling art and due to this reason the people of Düzce define Düzce not as a mosaic, but as a marbling art are of importance. This determination puts the fact that the first step is been thrown on the matter of ethnic marketing by putting forward that a medium in Düzce city is based on “tolerance and respect”.

REFERENCES


Lamont, Michèle and Virág Molnár (2001), “How Blacks Use Consumption to Shape their Purchasing behaviors, page 16


Appendix A: Depth Interview (DI) Demographic Structure

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>DI, name-surname</th>
<th>Kayhan Özdemir</th>
<th>Mustafa Bakangöz</th>
<th>Ömer Tokaliç</th>
<th>Birol Güney</th>
<th>Veysel Çakar</th>
<th>Tuncay Şahin</th>
<th>Servet Çatana</th>
<th>Mehmet Uysal</th>
<th>Ruhi Mutlu</th>
<th>Cemil Tanrıver</th>
<th>Osman Kesen</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ethnic Identity</td>
<td>Abkhazians</td>
<td>Albanians</td>
<td>Bosnians</td>
<td>Circassians</td>
<td>Georgians</td>
<td>Kurds</td>
<td>Lazes</td>
<td>Manav People</td>
<td>Muhajirs</td>
<td>Gypsies</td>
<td>Cremean Turks</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>67</td>
<td>58</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>67</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td>BD</td>
<td>MS</td>
<td>MS</td>
<td>BD</td>
<td>HS</td>
<td>Undergraduate Student</td>
<td>AD</td>
<td>BD</td>
<td>BD</td>
<td>MS</td>
<td>HS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Job</td>
<td>Civil Engineer</td>
<td>Self-employed</td>
<td>Self-employed</td>
<td>Retired Teacher</td>
<td>Retired Teacher</td>
<td>Self-employed</td>
<td>Self-employed</td>
<td>Retired Teacher</td>
<td>Investment Advisor</td>
<td>Reeve</td>
<td>Retired</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sex</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Male</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Appendix B: Focus Groups Interview (FGI) Demographic Structure

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>FGI Ethnic Groups names</th>
<th>Abkhazians</th>
<th>Albanians</th>
<th>Bosnians</th>
<th>Circassians</th>
<th>Georgians</th>
<th>Kurds</th>
<th>Lazes</th>
<th>Manav People</th>
<th>Muhajirs</th>
<th>Gypsies</th>
<th>Cremean Turks</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Number of Groups</td>
<td>6 person</td>
<td>7 person</td>
<td>6 person</td>
<td>9 person</td>
<td>6 person</td>
<td>6 person</td>
<td>7 person</td>
<td>6 person</td>
<td>6 person</td>
<td>10 person</td>
<td>10 person</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average Age Range</td>
<td>55,75</td>
<td>69</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>95,25</td>
<td>61,5</td>
<td>44,8</td>
<td>52,57</td>
<td>58</td>
<td>50,16</td>
<td>36,55</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td>1 PMS, 1 MS, 3 HS, 1 BD</td>
<td>2 NOE, 3PS, 1 AD, 1 BD</td>
<td>2 MS, 2 HS, 2 BD</td>
<td>2 PMS, 7 HS</td>
<td>6 NOE</td>
<td>4 NOE, 2 PMS</td>
<td>2 NOE, 3 PMS, 2 BD</td>
<td>5 PMS, 1 BD</td>
<td>3 NOE, 3 PMS, 1 HS</td>
<td>2 NOE, 4 PMS, 4 MS</td>
<td>2 NOE, 4 PMS, 3 HS, 1 BD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Job</td>
<td>4 Housewife, 1 Teacher, 1 Sewing Teacher.</td>
<td>2 Housewife, 2 Self-employed, 2 Student.</td>
<td>8 Housewife, 1 Student.</td>
<td>6 Housewife.</td>
<td>6 Housewife.</td>
<td>5 Housewife, 1 Teacher, 1 Student.</td>
<td>5 Housewife, 1 Retired.</td>
<td>6 Housewife, 1 Student.</td>
<td>10 Housewife.</td>
<td>9 Housewife, 1 Retired.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sex</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>Female</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Education: NOE: No Education, PMS: Primary School, MS: Middle School, HS: High School, AD: Associate Degree, BD: Bachelor's Degree